

AGENDA

Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

Date: October 21, 2004
Time: 1:30 p.m. (EST)
Location: Conference Room A
Indiana Government Conference Center
402 W. Washington Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Call to Order

Approval of the July meeting's minutes

I. Division Director's Report

II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by installing an eave vent at the Salmon Lusk Home in Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.
2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by remodeling the second floor restrooms in Turkey Run Inn at Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.
3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by creating a conference room in the Service Building (Park Office) at Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.

III. National Register Applications

1. Jonas Votaw House, 075-521-33100, 1525 S. Meridian Street, Portland, Jay County (1750)
2. John Keip House, 017-366-70661, 2500 East Broadway, Logansport, Cass County (1757)
3. Victory Noll-St. Felix Friary Historic District, 069-049-23007-23020, 1900 W. Park Dr./1280 Hitzfield St., Huntington, Huntington County (1784)
4. Joseph J. Bingham Indianapolis Public School #84, 097-296-22010, 440 East 57th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1788)
5. Wheeler-Stokely Mansion, 097-296-55005, 3200 Cold Springs Rd., Indianapolis, Marion County (1789)
6. Ralph Waldo Emerson Indianapolis Public School #58, 098-295-02188, 321 Linwood Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (1791)

7. **Brendonwood Historic District, 097-295-02000, roughly bounded by Fall Creek, 56th Street, and Brendon Forest Drive, Indianapolis, Marion County (1794)**
8. **Richwood Evangelical Lutheran Church, 035-618-55034, 9700 West CR 700 S, Middletown, Delaware County (1795)**
9. **Fowler Theatre, 111 East Fifth St., Fowler, Benton County (1797)**
10. **Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)**
11. **Irene Byron Tuberculosis Sanatorium – Physician’s Residences, 003-286-17013 and 17014, Allen County (1802)**
12. **Alexander T. Rankin House, 818 S. Lafayette St. Fort Wayne, Allen County (1805)**

V. Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

Listed

none

Rejected

none

Removed

None

VII. Set date for the next meeting

**Proposed date: January 26, 2005, Indiana Government Center,
Conference Room A, 1:30 p.m. (EST)**

TO: Members of the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

FROM: Jon Smith, Director, Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology

DATE: October 4, 2004

SUBJECT: Staff comments for items on the October 21, 2004, Agenda, also, note the new informational leaflet on procedural due process

II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by installing an eave vent at the Salmon Lusk Home in Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.1. A completed form was received by the DHPA on September 13, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Lusk Home and Mill site was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on October 29, 1974, and in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on January 16, 1974. As such, we recognize that the Salmon Lusk Home is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because a historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes removal of the existing gutters and gutter boards to expose the ends of the rafter and joist tails. A 2 1/8" continuous white perforated metal strip will be installed to the bottom portion of the joined rafter and joist tails at the front and rear sides of the building. Gutter boards and gutters will be reinstalled.

The staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.1 as its findings.

2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by remodeling the second floor restrooms in Turkey Run Inn at Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.2. A completed form was received by the DHPA on September 13, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Turkey Run State Park which, in part, lies within Penn, Sugar Creek, and Howard townships was identified in the Parke County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #121-659-00201. The Turkey Run Inn is one of many buildings and structures in the park, and formerly the members of the Historic Preservation Review Board ("Board") concluded that given the historical and architectural significance of the Turkey Run Inn, it is considered to be historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because an historic structure owned by the state and listed in the National Register will be altered by a project funded, apparently in part by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes installing a molded tub enclosure over existing tub walls where tile has buckled for the short term. During the off-season, all of the restrooms on the second floor will have a new tub and surround, toilet, floor tile, vanity sinks, mirrors, lights and towel/toilet paper bars installed. The existing restrooms do not retain any historically significant features, therefore staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.2 as its findings

3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by creating a conference room in the Service Building (Park Office) at Turkey Run State Park, Parke County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.3. A completed form was received by the DHPA on September 13, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Turkey Run State Park which, in part, lies within Penn, Sugar Creek, and Howard townships was identified in the Parke County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #121-659-00201. The Service Building is one of many buildings and structures in the park, and DHPA staff formerly determined it was significant due to its association with New Deal agency work within the park. As such, we believe that it is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because an historic structure owned by the state and listed in the National Register will be altered by a project funded, apparently in part by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes installing carpet or vinyl on the existing concrete floors and painting. The staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.3 as its findings.

III. State and National Register Applications

1. Jonas Votaw House, 075-521-33100, 1525 S. Meridian Street, Portland, Jay County (1750)

This house was given an "Outstanding" rating in the 1985 Jay County Interim Report for its local merit as an example of Italianate residential design. Jonas Votaw was a prominent Portland resident involved in Whig politics and railroad development but his activities do not rise to the level of Criterion B significance. The house is therefore being nominated for its architectural significance only. Although it has been added to and altered over time, the Votaw House, an outstanding example of the Italianate style when built, still illustrates the salient features of the style – bracketed cornice, hooded arched windows, side-hall plan, richly turned stairway. Its interior woodwork is distinctive and does not appear to be based on pattern book models. The house has been carefully maintained and so has good

integrity. The staff believes the Votaw House meets National Register Criterion C for its architectural significance and recommends approval at the local level.

- 2. John Keip House, 017-366-70661, 2500 East Broadway, Logansport, Cass County (1757)**
Rated “outstanding” in the 1984 Cass County Interim Report, this two story Arts and Crafts style house was recently restored to single family use. Character-defining elements like the oak stair with inglenook bench were restored (reinstalled). A professional office had used the house for a time, and in process, the owner had modified some features of the house. Staff conducted a site visit and determined that the Keip House is among the finest examples of Arts and Crafts design in the city. Staff recommends approval under Criterion C, local significance.
- 3. Victory Noll-St. Felix Friary Historic District, 069-049-23007-23020, 1900 W. Park Dr./1280 Hitzfield St., Huntington, Huntington County (1784)**
The district was identified in the 1997 Huntington County Interim Report as potentially eligible for listing in the National Register. Developed on 135 acres of farmland beginning in the 1920s, the motherhouse for the Missionary Sisters and the St. Felix Friary were built in a Spanish Missionary style and a compatible Mediterranean Revival style respectively. Although modern buildings have been added to the motherhouse complex, the overall ensemble in its wooded setting is locally the best grouping of 20th century revival style buildings. Staff recommends approval for the district as locally significant under National Register Criterion C.
- 4. Joseph J. Bingham Indianapolis Public School #84, 097-296-22010, 440 East 57th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1788)**
This school was rated “notable” in the 1999 Washington Township, Marion County Interim Report. The school is very intact, the most significant alteration is window replacement (c.1980). The period of significance includes the dates that the school was active and also the final date of the last significant addition to the building (1955). Since the last addition was put into use within two months of 50 years ago, the property does not need to meet Consideration G (less than 50 years old). Staff believes that the school meets the registration requirements established in the Multiple Property Documentation Form “Public School Buildings In Indianapolis Built Before 1940” and recommends approval for the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, local significance.
- 5. Wheeler-Stokely Mansion, 097-296-55005, 3200 Cold Springs Rd., Indianapolis, Marion County (1789)**
This property was rated “outstanding” in the 1993 Wayne Township, Marion County Interim Report. The estate includes landscape features as well as a variety of ancillary buildings. While no landscape architect has been determined and no formal plans are known to exist, the application includes enough data to confirm that the site contributes to the character of the estate. This application needs to meet Criterion Consideration A, since it is owned by a religious institution; the property does so since its importance historically is entirely unrelated to its present use. The property meets Criteria A and C. Under Criterion A, the property has significance for its association with the Country Place era in Indianapolis. Under Criterion C, the house is significant as an example of Price & McLanahan’s work. Staff recommends statewide significance for this nomination.
- 6. Ralph Waldo Emerson Indianapolis Public School #58, 098-295-02188, 321 Linwood Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (1791)**
This property was rated “contributing” in the 1991 Center Township Interim Report. Despite the low rating, the core historic building is intact. An addition made in 1967 meets the spirit of the recommendations of the Multiple Property Documentation Form, in that it is pulled back from, and lower than, the historic portions of the building. Window replacement has had an impact on the historic sections. The interior, however, is very intact and portrays a classic school of the early 20th century,

with some modernizations. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, local significance.

7. Brendonwood Historic District, 097-295-02000, roughly bounded by Fall Creek, 56th Street, and Brendon Forest Drive, Indianapolis, Marion County (1794)

Brendonwood was identified in the 1994 Pike and Lawrence Townships Interim Report, Marion County. The district has statewide significance as a remarkably intact example of George Edward Kessler's residential work. The application provides ample evidence of the original and current land uses, circulation patterns, and even some plantings (Mall, the hedges) to cite landscape architecture as an area of significance. Architecturally, the area includes a diverse gathering of popular early to mid-twentieth century housing types and styles, many designs executed by well-known Indianapolis architects. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, under Criteria A and C.

8. Richwood Evangelical Lutheran Church, 035-618-55034, 9700 West CR 700 S, Middletown, Delaware County (1795)

The 1985 Delaware County Interim Report rated this church "outstanding." The church meets Criterion C as an example of Late Gothic Revival architecture. The property needs to meet Consideration A (religious properties) as cited on the form, and staff feels that it does. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

9. Fowler Theatre, 111 East Fifth St., Fowler, Benton County (1797)

This 1940 Art Deco-Art Moderne theater is located in Fowler, Benton County. Benton County has not been surveyed but the theater would have received a "notable" rating. The Fowler Theatre is the only Art Deco building in the community and is the only remaining theater in approximately a 30-mile radius. While the enameled steel plates have been removed, the curvilinear Art Deco feel is evident and the interior is intact. Staff recommends approval for the Fowler Theatre under Criteria A and C for the State and National Registers.

10. Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)

This property was rated "contributing" in the 1991 Center Township, Marion County Interim Report. The application asserts that the building is a rare survivor of a once significant property type, the hotel (in particular, the residence hotel). The application includes a thorough description and good photographic documentation of those historic interior elements that do exist, and presents a case for the eligibility of the building. Staff, however, continues to be troubled by several issues regarding the property. The building is missing a key architectural element, its bay windows. In fact, so integral to the building's image are the bay windows, that one pictorial source for the building (Indiana Historical Society) files photos of the Barton Hotel under the heading "bow windows" (sic). If added together in lineal footage, the bay windows comprise about 60% of the total upper exterior walls (11 of 19 vertical bay divisions of the building were bay windows). Additionally, the projecting balconies with paired windows are gone, replaced by windows or smaller windows, and the distinctive Neo-Jacobean balustrade is missing. On the interior, some rooms and elements survive, however, staff (including staff architect) agreed that it was very difficult to tell what configuration the interior had during its prime years as a hotel in about 1925-1930. The most comparable recent situation that might come to mind for the board is Continental Towers (NR, Spink Arms Hotel, also a residence hotel) which retained a minimum of interior integrity, but, did retain its characteristic light wells and bay windows.

The application for the Barton Hotel provides a complete history of the property, and provides a case for its listing. Staff is unsure if the property type "middle price residence hotels" is too narrowly defined; conversely, even with diligent research, the applicant was not able to define physical characteristics of the residence hotel property type that set it aside from other hotels.

The board needs to decide whether hotel is emblematic of a significant trend, building type, or architectural style, and if so, whether the building has enough integrity as it exists today to still represent that trend or type.

11. Irene Byron Tuberculosis Sanatorium – Physician’s Residences, 003-286-17013 and 17014, Allen County (1802)

This site falls outside of the city limits of Fort Wayne and therefore this application was not processed by the Fort Wayne CLG (although their staff generously provided support). The 1989 Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory of Allen County (unpublished) identified a historic district on the grounds of the sanatorium. The two physician’s homes were both rated “outstanding.” Staff conducted a recent site visit to the property, and discovered that the virtually all other 25 buildings, save the ranch house nearby and a former 1950s hospital unit, located nearly ¼ mile west of the houses, were demolished some time after the survey. As a result, staff felt that insufficient cohesion exists to still pursue the recommended district. However, the two houses, and adjacent site features, represent a distinctive architectural grouping that meets Criterion C. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

12. Alexander T. Rankin House, 818 S. Lafayette St. Fort Wayne, Allen County (1805)

The Rankin House was built c.1841 and the application makes a case for eligibility under Criterion B, as part of a nation-wide Multiple Property Documentation Form, titled, Underground Railroad Resources in the United States Theme Study. The MPDF is both for NHLs and NR potential properties; in this case, the applicant is applying for NR status. While there are some questions about the nature of the construction of the house, in particular, why the one side wall is frame rather than brick, staff agrees that the house has substantial character from the time period of Rankin’s occupation, and meets the registration requirements of the MPDF. The Fort Wayne CLG has reviewed and approved the application. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, under Criterion B, statewide significance.